Plato's Divine Comedy. The Comic, Epic and Historical Catabasis of the *Protagoras*

1A Plato, Protagoras 314c-314e

Δόξαν ήμιν ταῦτα ἐπορευόμεθα· ἐπειδὴ δὲ ἐν τῷ 314c προθύρω ἐγενόμεθα, ἐπιστάντες περί τινος λόγου διελεγόμεθα, δς ήμιν κατὰ τὴν όδὸν ἐνέπεσεν· ἵν΄ οὖν μὴ ἀτελὴς γένοιτο, ἀλλὰ διαπερανάμενοι οὕτως ἐσίοιμεν, στάντες ἐν τῷ προθύρῳ διελεγόμεθα ἕως συνωμολογήσαμεν ἀλλήλοις. δοκεῖ οὖν μοι, ὁ θυρωρός, εὐνοῦχός τις, κατήκουεν ήμῶν, κινδυνεύει δὲ διὰ τὸ πλῆθος τῶν σοφιστῶν 314d ἄχθεσθαι τοῖς φοιτῶσιν εἰς τὴν οἰκίαν· ἐπειδὴ γοῦν ἐκρούσαμεν τὴν θύραν, ἀνοίξας καὶ ἰδὼν ήμᾶς, "Έα," ἔφη, "σοφισταί τινες οὐ σχολή αὐτῷ-" καὶ ἄμα ἀμφοῖν τοῖν χεροῖν τὴν θύραν πάνυ προθύμως ώς οἶός τ' ἦν ἐπήραξεν. καὶ ἡμεῖς πάλιν ἐκρούομεν, καὶ ὃς ἐγκεκλημένης τῆς θύρας ἀποκρινόμενος εἶπεν, "Ὁ ἄνθρωποι," ἔφη, "οὐκ ἀκηκόατε ὅτι οὐ σχολὴ αὐτῷ;" "Άλλ' ἀγαθέ," ἔφην ἐγώ, "οὔτε παρὰ Καλλίαν ἥκομεν οὔτε σοφισταί ἐσμεν. ἀλλὰ θάρρει· Πρωταγόραν γάρ 314e τοι δεόμενοι ίδεῖν ἤλθομεν· εἰσάγγειλον οὖν." μόγις οὖν ποτε ἡμῖν ἄνθοωπος ἀνέωξεν τὴν θύραν.

Having agreed on this, we set out. When we got to the doorway we stood there discussing some point which had come up along the road and which we didn't want to leave unsettled before we went in. So we were standing there in the doorway discussing it until we reached an agreement, and I think the doorman, a eunuch, overheard us. He must have been annoyed with all the traffic of sophists in and out of the house, because when we knocked he opened the door, took one look at us and said, "Ha! More sophists! He's busy." Then he slammed the door in our faces with both hands as hard as he could. We knocked again, and he answered through the locked door, "Didn't you hear me say he's busy?" "My good man," I said, "we haven't come to see Callias, and we are not sophists. Calm down. We want to see Protagoras. That's why we've come. So please announce us." Eventually he opened the door for us.

1B Aristophanes, Acharnians 393-409

ΔΙΚΑΙΟΠΟΛΙΣ ὤρα 'στὶν άρμοῖ καρτερὰν ψυχὴν λαβεῖν·

καί μοι βαδιστέ' ἐστὶν ώς Εὐριπίδην.

παῖ παῖ. ΘΕΡΑΠΩΝ τίς οὖτος;

ἔνδον ἔστ' Εὐριπίδης;

Θ. οὐκ ἔνδον ἔνδον ἐστίν, εἰ γνώμην ἔχεις.

Δ. πῶς ἔνδον, εἶτ' οὐκ ἔνδον;

Θ. ὀρθῶς, ὧ γέρον.

ό νοῦς μὲν ἔξω ξυλλέγων ἐπύλλια

κοὐκ ἔνδον, αὐτὸς δ' ἔνδον ἀναβάδην ποιεῖ

τραγωδίαν. 400

395

Δ. ὦ τρισμακάρι' Εὐριπίδη,

őθ' ὁ δοῦλος ούτωσὶ σοφῶς ὑποκρίνεται.

ἐκκάλεσον αὐτόν.

Θ. ἀλλ' ἀδύνατον.

Δ. ἀλλ' ὅμως·

οὐ γὰο ἂν ἀπέλθοιμ', ἀλλὰ κόψω τὴν θύραν. Εὐριπίδη, Εὐριπίδιον,

DICAEOPOLIS Now's the time to gain a sturdy heart, and make a visit to Euripides. (He knocks on Euripides' door) Boy! Boy!

SLAVE (opening the door a crack) Who's that?

D. Is Euripides at home?

S. He's home and not at home, if you get my point.

D. Home and not at home—how can that be?

S. It's straightforward, old sir. His mind, being outside collecting versicles, is not at home, while he himself is at home, with his feet up, composing tragedy.

D. Thrice-blessed Euripides, that your slave renders you so convincingly! Ask him to come out.

S. Quite impossible. (He shuts the door)

D. Do it anyway. Well, I won't leave; I'll keep knocking on the door. Euripides! Dear Euripides, answer, if ever you answered any mortal. Dicaeopolis of Cholleidai calls you—'tis I.

EURIPIDES (from within) I'm busy.

D. Then have yourself wheeled out.

E. Quite impossible.

ύπάκουσον, εἴπερ πώποτ' ἀνθρώπων τινί·

405 Δικαιόπολις καλεῖ σε Χολλήδης, ἐγώ.

ΕΥΡΙΠΙΔΗΣ ἀλλ' οὐ σχολή.

Δ. ἀλλ' ἐκκυκλήθητ'.

Ε. ἀλλ' ἀδύνατον.

Δ. ἀλλ' ὅμως.

Ε. ἀλλ' ἐκκυκλήσομαι· καταβαίνειν δ' οὐ σχολή.

D. Do it anyway.

E. All right, I'll have myself wheeled out; I've no time to get up. (Euripides is revealed reclining on a couch).

2 Plato, Protagoras 314e-315b

Έπειδὴ δè εἰσήλθομεν, κατελάβομεν Πρωταγόραν ἐν τῷ προστώω περιπατοῦντα, ἑξῆς δ' αὐτῷ συμπεριεπάτουν ἐκ μὲν τοῦ ἐπὶ θάτερα Καλλίας ὁ Ἱππονίκου καὶ ὁ ἀδελφὸς αὐτοῦ ὁ 315α όμομήτριος, Πάραλος ό Περικλέους, καὶ Χαρμίδης ό Γλαύκωνος, ἐκ δὲ τοῦ ἐπὶ θάτερα ὁ ἕτερος τῶν Περικλέους Εάνθιππος, καὶ Φιλιππίδης ό Φιλομήλου καὶ Άντίμοιρος ὁ Μενδαῖος, ὅσπερ εὐδοκιμεῖ μάλιστα τῶν Πρωταγόρου μαθητῶν καὶ ἐπὶ τέχνη μανθάνει, ὡς σοφιστής ἐσόμενος. τούτων δὲ οὶ ὅπισθεν ἠκολούθουν ἐπακούοντες τῶν λεγομένων τὸ μὲν πολὺ ξένοι ἐφαίνοντο ους άγει έξ έκάστων των πόλεων ό Πρωταγόρας, δι' ὧν διεξέρχεται, κηλῶν τῆ φωνῆ ὥσπερ Όρφεύς, οἱ δὲ κατὰ τὴν φωνὴν ἕπονται 315 κεκηλημένοι - ἦσαν δέ τινες καὶ τῶν ἐπιχωρίων ἐν τῷ χορῷ. τοῦτον τὸν χορὸν μάλιστα ἔγωγε ἰδὼν ήσθην, ώς καλῶς ηὐλαβοῦντο μηδέποτε ἐμποδὼν έν τῷ πρόσθεν εἶναι Πρωταγόρου, ἀλλ' ἐπειδὴ αὐτὸς ἀναστρέφοι καὶ οἱ μετ' ἐκείνου, εὖ πως καὶ έν κόσμω περιεσχίζοντο οὗτοι οἱ ἐπήκοοι ἔνθεν καὶ ἔνθεν, καὶ ἐν κύκλω περιιόντες ἀεὶ εἰς τὸ ὄπισθεν καθίσταντο κάλλιστα.

When we went in we found Protagoras walking in the portico flanked by two groups. On one side were Callias, son of Hipponicus, and his brother on his mother's side, Paralus, son of Pericles, and Charmides, son of Glaucon. On the other side were Pericles' other son, Xanthippus, Philippides, son of Philomelus, and Antimoerus of Mende, Protagoras' star pupil who is studying professionally to become a sophist. Following behind and trying to listen to what was being said were a group of what seemed to be mostly foreigners, men whom Protagoras collects from the various cities he travels through. He enchants them with his voice like Orpheus, and they follow the sound of his voice in a trance. There were some locals also in this chorus, whose dance simply delighted me when I saw how beautifully they took care never to get in Protagoras' way. When he turned around with his flanking groups, the audience to the rear would split into two in a very orderly way and then circle around to either side and form up again behind him. It was quite lovely.

3A Plato, Protagoras 315b-316a

Τὸν δὲ μετ΄ εἰσενόησα, ἔφη Όμηρος, Ἰππίαν τὸν [Ἡλεῖον, καθήμενον ἐν τῷ κατ' ἀντικρὺ προστώφ 315c ἐν θρόνφ· περὶ αὐτὸν δ' ἐκάθηντο ἐπὶ βάθρων Ἐρυξίμαχός τε ὁ Ἀκουμενοῦ καὶ Φαῖδρος ὁ Μυρρινούσιος καὶ Ἄνδρων ὁ Ἀνδροτίωνος καὶ τῶν ξένων πολῖταί τε αὐτοῦ καὶ ἄλλοι τινές. ἐφαίνοντο δὲ περὶ φύσεώς τε καὶ τῶν μετεώρων ἀστρονομικὰ ἄττα διερωτᾶν τὸν Ἰππίαν, ὁ δ' ἐν θρόνφ καθήμενος ἑκάστοις αὐτῶν διέκρινεν καὶ διεξήει τὰ ἐρωτώμενα.

And then I perceived (as Homer says) Hippias of Elis, on a high seat in the other side of the colonnade. Seated on benches around him were Eryximachus, son of Acumenus, Phaedrus of Myrrhinus, Andron, son of Androtion, a number of Elians and a few other foreigners. They seemed to be asking Hippias questions on astronomy and physics, and he, from his high seat, was answering each of their questions point by point.

Καὶ μὲν δὴ καὶ Τάνταλόν γε εἰσεῖδον – ἐπεδήμει 315d γὰρ ἄρα καὶ Πρόδικος ὁ Κεῖος –ἦν δὲ ἐν οἰκήματί τινι, ῷ πρὸ τοῦ μὲν ὡς ταμιείω ἐχρῆτο Ἱππόνικος, νῦν δὲ ὑπὸ τοῦ πλήθους τῶν καταλυόντων ὁ Καλλίας καὶ τοῦτο ἐκκενώσας ξένοις κατάλυσιν πεποίηκεν. ὁ μὲν οὖν Πρόδικος ἔτι κατέκειτο, έγκεκαλυμμένος έν κωδίοις τισίν καὶ στρώμασιν καὶ μάλα πολλοῖς, ὡς ἐφαίνετο· παρεκάθηντο δὲ αὐτῷ ἐπὶ ταῖς πλησίον κλίναις Παυσανίας τε ὁ ἐκ Κεραμέων καὶ μετὰ Παυσανίου νέον τι ἔτι 315e μειράκιον, ώς μὲν ἐγῷμαι καλόν τε κἀγαθὸν τὴν φύσιν, τὴν δ' οὖν ἰδέαν πάνυ καλός. ἔδοξα ἀκοῦσαι ὄνομα αὐτῷ εἶναι Ἁγάθωνα, καὶ οὐκ ἂν θαυμάζοιμι εἰ παιδικὰ Παυσανίου τυγχάνει ὤν. τοῦτό τ' ἦν τὸ μειράκιον, καὶ τὼ Ἀδειμάντω αμφοτέρω, ὅ τε Κήπιδος καὶ ὁ Λευκολοφίδου, καὶ ἄλλοι τινὲς ἐφαίνοντο· περὶ δὲ ὧν διελέγοντο οὐκ έδυνάμην ἔγωγε μαθεῖν ἔξωθεν, καίπες λιπαςῶς έχων ἀκούειν τοῦ Ποοδίκου-πάσσοφος γάρ μοι 316α δοκεῖ άνὴς εἶναι καὶ θεῖος—ἀλλὰ διὰ τὴν βαρύτητα τῆς φωνῆς βόμβος τις ἐν τῷ οἰκήματι γιγνόμενος ἀσαφῆ ἐποίει τὰ λεγόμενα. Καὶ ἡμεῖς μὲν ἄρτι εἰσεληλύθεμεν, κατόπιν δὲ ἡμῶν ἐπεισῆλθον Ἀλκιβιάδης τε ὁ καλός, ώς φὴς σὺ καὶ ἐγὼ πείθομαι, καὶ Κριτίας ὁ Καλλαίσχρου.

And not only that, but I saw Tantalus too, for Prodicus of Ceos was also in town. He was in a room which Hipponicus had formerly used for storage, but because of the number of visitors Callias had cleared it out and made it into a guest room. Prodicus was still in bed and looked to be bundled up in a pile of sheepskin fleeces and blankets. Seated on couches next to him were Pausanias from Cerames, and with Pausanias a fairly young boy, well-bred I would say, and certainly good-looking. I think I heard his name is Agathon, and I wouldn't be surprised if he were Pausanias' young love. So this boy was there, and the two Adeimantuses, sons of Cepis and Leucolophides, and there seemed to be some others. What they were talking about I couldn't tell from outside, even though I really wanted to hear Prodicus, a man who in my opinion is godlike in his universal knowledge. But his voice is so deep that it set up a reverberation in the room that blurred what was being said. We had just arrived when along came Alcibiades the Beautiful (as you call him, and I'm not arguing) and Critias son of Callaeschrus.

3B Homer, Odyssey XI 572, 582-614

τὸν δὲ μέτ' Ὠρίωνα πελώριον εἰσενόησα [...]
καὶ μὴν Τάνταλον εἰσεῖδον χαλέπ' ἄλγε' ἔχοντα,
έσταότ' ἐν λίμνη· ἡ δὲ προσέπλαζε γενείω.
στεῦτο δὲ διψάων, πιέειν δ' οὐκ εἶχεν ἑλέσθαι·
585 ὁσσάκι γὰρ κύψει' ὁ γέρων πιέειν μενεαίνων,
τοσσάχ' ὕδωρ ἀπολέσκετ' ἀναβροχέν, ἀμφὶ δὲ

ποσοὶ γαῖα μέλαινα φάνεσκε, καταζήνασκε δὲ δαίμων. δένδοεα δ΄ ὑψιπέτηλα κατὰ κοῆθεν χέε καρπόν, ὄγχναι καὶ ὁοιαὶ καὶ μηλέαι ἀγλαόκαρποι 590 συκέαι τε γλυκεραὶ καὶ ἐλαῖαι τηλεθόωσαιτῶν ὁπότ΄ ἰθύσει΄ ὁ γέρων ἐπὶ χεροὶ μάσασθαι, τὰς δ΄ ἄνεμος ὁίπτασκε ποτὶ νέφεα σκιόεντα. καὶ μὴν Σίσυφον εἰσεῖδον κρατέρ΄ ἄλγε΄ ἔχοντα, λᾶαν βαστάζοντα πελώριον ἀμφοτέρησιν.

595 ἦ τοι ὁ μὲν σκηριπτόμενος χερσίν τε ποσίν τε λᾶαν ἄνω ὤθεσκε ποτὶ λόφον· ἀλλ' ὅτε μέλλοι ἄκρον ὑπερβαλέειν, τότ' ἀποστρέψασκε Κραταιϊς· αὖτις ἔπειτα πέδονδε κυλίνδετο λᾶας ἀναιδής. αὐτὰρ ὅ γ' ἄψ ὤσασκε τιταινόμενος, κατὰ δ' ίδρὼς

600 ἔφρεεν ἐκ μελέων, κονίη δ' ἐκ κρατὸς ὀρώρει. τὸν δὲ μέτ' εἰσενόησα βίην Ἡρακληείην,

"After him I became aware of gigantic Orion, [...] I also saw Tantalos suffering painful torment, as he stood in a pool, the water lapping his chin: he was maddened with thirst, yet couldn't ever reach it, for whenever the old fellow bent down to drink the water was sucked down and vanished, and around his feet the black earth appeared, dried up by some god. Trees too, high and leafy, hung top-heavy with fruitpears, pomegranates, boughs laden with shining apples, sweet figs, a profusion of olives. But every time the old man reached out to grasp them, a gust of wind would whirl them aloft toward the shadowy clouds. "I also saw Sisyphos suffering most painful torment, as he labored to raise a huge stone with his two bare hands: scrambling with hands and feet he'd try to push it up to the crest of the hill; but when he was on the point of getting it over the top, its weight would defeat him: bumpity back to the plain the shameless stone would clatter.

Yet he kept straining and heaving, while the sweat streamed down from his limbs, and the dust rose swirling around his head. "After him I became aware of powerful Hēraklēs,

εἴδωλον· αὐτὸς δὲ μετ' ἀθανάτοισι θεοῖσι τέρπεται ἐν θαλίης καὶ ἔχει καλλίσφυρον Ἦβην, παῖδα Διὸς μεγάλοιο καὶ Ἡρης χρυσοπεδίλου.

605 ἀμφὶ δέ μιν κλαγγὴ νεκύων ἦν οἰωνῶν ὥς, πάντοσ' ἀτυζομένων· ὁ δ' ἐρεμνῆ νυκτὶ ἐοικώς, γυμνὸν τόξον ἔχων καὶ ἐπὶ νευρῆφιν ὀϊστόν, δεινὸν παπταίνων, αἰεὶ βαλέοντι ἐοικώς. σμερδαλέος δέ οἱ ἀμφὶ περὶ στήθεσσιν ἀορτὴρ χρύσεος ἦν τελαμών, ἵνα θέσκελα ἔργα τέτυκτο, ἄρκτοι τ' ἀγρότεροί τε σύες χαροποί τε λέοντες, ὑσμῖναί τε μάχαι τε φόνοι τ' ἀνδροκτασίαι τε. μὴ τεχνησάμενος μηδ' ἄλλο τι τεχνήσαιτο, ὃς κεῖνον τελαμῶνα ἑῆ ἐγκάτθετο τέχνη.

his phantom, for he himself among the immortal gods takes joy in the feast, and has the elegant-ankled Hēbē, child of great Zeus and the golden-sandaled Hērē: around him arose a bird like clamor from the dead as they scattered in terror, while he, as dark as night, holding a bare bow with an arrow at the string, kept glancing sharply round him, as though about to shoot. A fearsome thing was the baldric girding his torso, a belt of gold on which wondrous objects had been

fashioned—

bears and wild boars, and lions with glinting eyes, and fights and battles and murder and the slayings of men. May he never have crafted, or again craft, another such, the man who stamped that belt with his special

craftsmanship!

Selected bibliography

Critical texts

- J. Burnet (ed.), Platonis opera, III, Oxford 1903
- F. W. Lenz, C. A. Behr (edd.), P. Aelii Aristidis Opera quae exstant omnia, I, Orationes I-XVI complectens, Leiden 1978
- P. von der Mühll (ed.), Homeri Odyssea, Basel 1962
- N. G. Wilson, Aristophanis Fabulae, I, Oxford 2007

English translations (modified)

- C. A. Behr (ed.), P. Aelius Aristides. The Complete Works. Volume I, Orations I-XVI, Leiden 1986
- J. M. Cooper, D. S. Hutchinson (edd.), Plato. Complete Works, Indianapolis (IN) 1997
- P. Green (ed.), Homer. Odyssey, Oakland (CA) 2018
- J. Henderson (ed.), Aristophanes. Acharnians Knights, Cambridge (MA) 1998Capra Handout

Secondary literature

- S. Caciagli, D. De Sanctis, M. Giovannelli, M. Regali, *Usci, soglie e portinai. Thyra nella commedia greca*, «Lessico del comico» 1, 2016, pp. 31-54
- L. Canfora, La crisi dell'utopia. Aristofane contro Platone, Bari 2014
- A. Capra, Άγων λόγων: il Protagora di Platone tra eristica e commedia, Milano 2001
- M. Dorati, Platone ed Eupoli (Protagora 314c-316a), «QUCC» 79, 1995, pp. 87-103
- E. Dupréel, La légende socratique et les sources de Platon, Bruxelles 1922
- C. H. Kahn, On the Relative Date of the Gorgias and the Protagoras, «OSAPh» 6, 1988, pp. 69-102
- C. H. Kahn, Plato and Socrates in the Protagoras, «Méthexis» 1, 1988, pp. 33-51
- G. W. Most, Reading Raphael: The School of Athens and Its Pre-Text, «Critical Inquiry» 23, 1996, pp. 145-182
- M. Napolitano, I Kolakes di Eupoli, Berlin 2012
- D. Nails, The People of Plato: A Prosopography of Plato and Other Socratics, Indianapolis 2002
- H. Segvic, Homer in Plato's Protagoras, «CPh» 101, 2006, pp. 247-262
- K. Sidwell, Some Thoughts on the Sophist in Bed, «Hermathena» 179, 2005, pp. 67-76
- J. Walsh, The Dramatic Dates of Plato's Protagoras and the Lesson of Arete, «CQ» 34, 1984, pp. 101-106
- C. W. Willink, Prodikos, Meteorosophist and the Tantalos Paradigm, «CQ» 77, 1983, pp. 25-33
- D. C. Wolfsdorf, The Historical Reader of Plato's Protagoras, «CQ» 92, 1998, pp. 126-133